

Letter to the Editor

Keywords: Quotation accuracy; Pseudo-first-order; Pseudo-second-order; Kinetics; Biosorption

Comments on “Efficiency of membrane-sorption integrated processes”

The purposes of including references are to assist in validating a paper, improve its readability, and direct readers who are interested in relevant topics to other appropriate material [1]. Therefore, references must be supplied with correct information and be specific especially when citing theories and equations. The original sources for the information that is used in the text should be found in the cited references. One common mistake is to cite papers that are devoid of the original information, but have used the original information of others to develop their own arguments [1]. A number of researchers pointed out that the rates of citation and quotation errors are unacceptably high in journals, which significantly diminishes the value of the reference list [2–4]. It has been strongly urged that the peer review of citation and quotation accuracy should be strengthened [5]. In a reference and quotation accuracy study, Gosling et al. concluded that “Take no reference for granted. Verify the reference that your best friend gives you. Verify the reference that your revered chief gives you. Verify, most of all, the reference that you yourself found and jotted down. To err is human, to verify is necessary” [6]. Poor citation and quotation would not only reduce the value of research but also reflect the inefficient works that are done by authors and journals.

Recently, Koltuniewicz et al. published the paper with the above title [7]. In Section 3.2, Kinetics of the sorption process, the authors described the kinetics of the sorption process and listed a first-order and pseudo-second-order reaction kinetic equations in a table. There was a quotation error but no doubt about Koltuniewicz et al. paper, which was previously evaluated and accepted for publication. Authors cited a paper as a secondary Ref. [8], in which the authors did not mention the first-order and the pseudo-second-order reaction

model in the paper. It was Lagergren who first presented the first-order rate equation for the adsorption of ocalic acid and malonic acid onto charcoal [9]. Lagergren’s kinetics equation has been most widely used for the adsorption of an adsorbate from an aqueous solution. In order to distinguish the kinetics equation based on the adsorption capacity of solid from the concentration of solution, Lagergren’s first-order rate equation has been called pseudo-first-order since 1998 [10]. In addition, citation review of Lagergren’s kinetic rate equation on adsorption reactions has also been reported [11]. A second-order kinetic expression for the adsorption systems of divalent metal ions using sphagnum peat moss was reported by Ho [12]. In order to distinguish the kinetic equation based on the adsorption capacity of solid from the one that is based on the concentration of solution, Ho’s second-order rate expression has been called pseudo-second-order [12,13]. The most-frequently cited paper was published in *Water Research* [13]. The pseudo-second-order rate expression of Ho has been widely applied to the sorption of metal ions, dyes, herbicides, oil, pesticides, and organic substances from aqueous solutions [14].

As the results of the above review, I suggest that Koltuniewicz et al. should cite Lagergren’s first-order kinetic model paper and Ho’s original pseudo-second-order kinetic expression paper.

References

- [1] D.McD. Taylor, A.F.T. Brown, Analysis of the study design and manuscript deficiencies in research articles, submitted to *Emergency Medicine*, *Emerg. Med.* 13 (2001) 444.
- [2] V.J. Roach, T.K. Lau, W.D.N. Kee, The quality of citations in major international obstetrics and gynecology journals, *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* 177 (1997) 973.
- [3] R. Siebers, The accuracy of references of three allergy journals, *J. Allergy Clin. Immunol.* 105 (2000) 837.

- [4] A. Vargas-Origel, G. Gómez-Martínez, M.A. Vargas-Nieto, The accuracy of references in paediatric journals, *Arch. Dis. Child.* 85 (2001) 497.
- [5] S.Y. Lee, J.S. Lee, A survey of reference accuracy in two Asian dermatologic journals (the *Journal of Dermatology* and the *Korean Journal of Dermatology*), *Int. J. Dermatol.* 38 (1999) 357.
- [6] C.M. Gosling, M. Cameron, P.F. Gibbons, Referencing and quotation accuracy in four manual therapy journals, *Man. Ther.* 9 (2004) 36.
- [7] A.B. Koltuniewicz, A. Witek, K. Bezak, Efficiency of membrane-sorption integrated processes, *J. Membr. Sci.* 239 (2004) 129.
- [8] F. Pagnanelli, F. Beolchini, A. Di Biase, F. Vegliò, Effect of equilibrium models in the simulation of heavy metal biosorption in single and two-stage UF/MF membrane reactor systems, *Biochem. Eng. J.* 15 (2003) 27.
- [9] S. Lagergren, Zur theorie der sogenannten adsorption gelöster stoffe, *K. Sven. Vetenskapsakad. Handl.* 24 (1898) 1.
- [10] Y.S. Ho, G. McKay, Kinetic models for the sorption of dye from aqueous solution by wood, *Process Saf. Environ. Protect.* 76B (1998) 183.
- [11] Y.S. Ho, Citation review of Lagergren kinetic rate equation on adsorption reactions, *Scientometrics* 59 (2004) 171.
- [12] Y.S. Ho, Absorption of heavy metals from waste streams by peat, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Birmingham, UK, 1995.
- [13] Y.S. Ho, G. McKay, The kinetics of sorption of divalent metal ions onto sphagnum moss peat, *Water Res.* 34 (2000) 735.
- [14] Y.S. Ho, Comment on “Selective adsorption of tannins onto hide collagen fibres”, *Sci. China Ser. B: Chem.* 48 (2005) 176.

Yuh-Shan Ho*

*Department of Environmental Sciences
College of Environmental Sciences, Peking University
Beijing 100871, PR China*

* Tel.: +86 10 6275 1923; fax: +86 10 6275 1923

E-mail address: dr_ysho@hotmail.com

24 January 2005

Available online 18 July 2005